



**KONSTANTIN PRES LAVSKY UNIVERSITY OF  
SHUMEN  
FACULTY OF TECHNICAL SCIENCES  
MANAGEMENT OF SECURITY SYSTEMS DEPARTMENT**

---

**R E V I E W**

**By Prof. Ivo Velikov Velikov, Ph.D.**

Varna Free University “Chernorizets Hrabar“

Member of the State Commission on Information Security

of a dissertation work of Ivan Ivanov Kantardzhiev on the topic

**EFFECTIVENESS AND EFFICIENCY OF THE  
COUNTERINTELLIGENCE UNIT IN THE CORPORATE SECURITY  
SERVICE**

for awarding the educational and scientific degree “Doctor”

under the doctoral program “Administrative security”

Professional field 9.1. National Security

Field of higher education 9. Security and defense

Scientific supervisors: Prof. Stanimir Stoyanov Stanev, PhD

Prof. Hristo Atanasov Hristov, PhD

SHUMEN

2022

## **1. Topicality and significance of the developed scientific problem**

The topic of the dissertation work of the doctoral student Ivan Kantardzhiev is undoubtedly interesting and will probably become more and more topical with time. On the one hand, the skillful interweaving of corporate security in the national one can be considered an original idea, and on the other – in the popular and scientific literature and in the media, the idea of the CCIU is sparsely represented, despite the undoubted benefit and the clear presence for those who are familiar with it (e.g. through security manuals such as with Anatoly Taras, or film productions from different countries). However, according to the author, quoting Doronin, the cost of preventive business programs to ensure corporate security is more than 36 billion dollars (p. 8), especially in the presence of tourists from China, Korea, Japan, who have 3 cameras each and awareness of belonging to certain government or company policies. The topicality and significance of this work can be realized from the finding that 80% of the total number of bankrupt enterprises collapse due to a lack of qualified specialists competent in the field of industrial counterintelligence (p. 24).

We believe that the experience of Bulgarian companies in corporate security is not enough and rather there are no traditions on which to rely and develop such activities. Therefore, any new creativity in this area is a significant contribution to the development of one's own corporate policies in this area.

In the process of getting acquainted with the dissertation we are pleased to find a clear and obviously consciously applied approach - the first chapter is theoretical, the second chapter is analytical, the third chapter is more applied than analytical (we cannot ignore the analytical efforts of the doctoral student without noting them), which is why we consider this part to be applied-analytical. Thus, an established scientific approach "from theoretical to applied" is realized. We also appreciate the rather concise, laconic, and concrete presentation of the individual

elements of the introduction, the contributions, as well as the author's rather direct scientific style.

## **2. General characteristics and structure of the dissertation**

The dissertation is structured in an introduction, three chapters, a conclusion, references, a list of publications related to the topic of the dissertation, and appendices. The volume is 175 pages, of which 157 pages contain main text. The list of abbreviations used is correctly placed prior to the introduction. The references include 169 reference sources in Bulgarian, Russian and English. The knowledge of the important Bulgarian authors in the field of security also makes a good impression.

The introduction fulfills its role fully and gives an idea of the good preliminary attitude of the author for conducting the research. The individual elements are specific and clear - a hypothesis that is a scientific hypothesis undoubtedly; objective and precise tasks; limitations that show a good idea of content and volume, as well as a good connection with the scientific management; object and subject without any deviations, uncompromisingly briefly outlined; methodology, which in general is presented correctly (here is probably the only element to which claims can be made) and is fully relevant to the implementation of the objective and tasks of the study.

The first chapter "Theoretical aspects of the counterintelligence activity of the security services of the business organizations" is useful and necessary as a theoretical basis for the entire dissertation. The author not only strives to maximize the clarifying of the concepts he uses (from national security, through economic security to corporate security; from intelligence and counterintelligence through corporate intelligence to corporate counterintelligence) but also tries to demonstrate conceptual dynamics, i.e. to show the development of these concepts and to show

the mutual penetration of these types of concepts. For the first time, a non-lawyer uses both terms – spying (the translated one and more popular) and espionage – the Bulgarian one, according to the Penal Code.

The threats to business organizations and the need for CCIU are considered very professionally and in view of the real state of the environment. The main concepts of the title “effectiveness” and “efficiency” are considered in nuances, but the approach in the National Audit Office Act is still adopted.

The first chapter ends with comprehensive and content-rich conclusions.

The second chapter “Main types of providing the activities of the corporate counterintelligence unit” is analytical and applied development of the dissertation. Based on a wide and in our opinion completely modern and real study of an appropriate sample of respondents (only in the region and specifically related to the topic of the doctoral student), substantiate the main provisions for the development of the company’s CIU - threats to the company without CSS, benefits (the balance of the American market is impressive - each dollar invested in such an activity returns a 13-dollar profit), intentions, views of managers, knowledge of the problems, and of course - the financing of such activities. To the extent that in the country a reform is carried out mainly through budget changes, the creation of a comprehensive approach to the CSS and CCIU, financial structure, calculation algorithm, inclusive of formulas and examples, is a serious applied-analytical contribution of the author in this chapter. Apparently, he himself is aware of it and has emphasized it in the conclusions of the chapter. We would agree that a real scientific approach has been implemented herein - practical market research leads to the application of scientific approaches and new quality.

The third chapter “Increasing the effectiveness and efficiency of the activity of the corporate counterintelligence unit of the business organization” develops the scientific knowledge in the direction of the proper use of the CIU. The pleasant

surprise here is the successful adaptation of the approaches known by the CIA for the implementation of the main tasks to the environment of the BO. Another obvious merit of the author is the visualization through diagrams and tables of his ideas, which significantly help the understanding of his ideas, even by non-specialists. The use of multiple formulas in different methodologies without such diagrams makes understanding ideas a complex task.

The third chapter, through the developed methodologies, gives a clear applied meaning to the other two chapters, as it is obviously directly related to the subject of the dissertation and the implementation of the tasks, and its objective, respectively. It gives grounds for a logical conclusion that scientific knowledge in the field of corporate security has been developed and enriched.

The conclusion fully fulfills its role - it summarizes the work, indicates the places and approaches to solving research tasks and objectives, shows the author's innovations and proposals, and predicts the development of the topic both in terms of the security environment and future research efforts.

The authorship of the doctoral student Kantardzhiev is undoubted. The reason for this conclusion is the overall type of work - always concise, accurate, and specific style, obviously well-established scientific style of expression. The skillful limitation of the topic in the field of financing of the CIU, as the effectiveness and efficiency are suggested as quite widely applicable in the whole activity, gives grounds to claim that the doctoral student had an initial idea of the volume and content of work.

### **3. Scientific and scientific-applied contributions in the dissertation**

We accept the contributions presented by the author in the dissertation. Prior to the defense in front of the department, there were some notes about the

structuring of the contributions, but in conversations with the doctoral student and the supervisors, they were duly removed.

As a formulation and content, however, we welcome this characteristic style of expression of the author - each of the contributions is explained in one sentence, as specific and concise as possible.

There is no doubt that the contributions are the work of the author.

#### **4. Assessment of the dissertation publications and authorship**

On the topic of the dissertation, the doctoral student presented five publications (three articles and two papers), some in co-authorship with his supervisors. They reflect the main points of the dissertation and directly correspond to the topic of the dissertation. They have been published within the last 4 years, which is an indicator of the constant and consistent interest of the author on the topic (there are publications from 2018, 2019, 2020, and 2021).

#### **5. Literary awareness and competence of the doctoral student**

Given the specific nature and often very specialized technical information on the topic, I believe that in developing the dissertation the author has found and used a sufficient amount of popular and scientific literature. The sources are 100% created after 2000, and over 80% are issued after 2015, which is fully consistent with the nature of the topic.

#### **6. Critical notes**

I believe that critical notes can be made about the dissertation, which do not change my overall positive assessment of it. As such, I can list (apart from the remarks above on the presentation of the methodology and the list of research methods, as well as on the rearrangement of contributions):

- the serious mathematical apparatus that is used probably needs more explanations and comments. In this case, the dissertation becomes difficult to comprehend for a wider range of readers, non-specialists, or specialists with humanitarian education;

- we find the US model to be underdeveloped, and other developed countries, which is suggested on pages 64-65 - to observe a tendency for direct participation of the state counterintelligence in the protection of trade secrets of large corporations. We consider the model itself to be unique and interesting, it needs to be adapted to our conditions.

On the whole, our notes are more recommendations than criticism within the true meaning of the word.

### **7. Assessment of the abstract**

The abstract is developed according to the requirements and gives a complete notion of the scientific value and practical applicability of the achieved contributions. The abstract is highly analytical, I take it as a good example of volume and content.

### **8. Personal impressions of the doctoral student**

I have known the doctoral student Ivan Kantardzhiev for a while. From my few contacts with him, I have the impression of high professionalism and proper scientific orientation in the current situation and in view of his expertise. I know the two supervisors very well and through them - the main problems and fluctuations in the course of creating this work. I believe that both the doctoral student and the scientific management made the necessary efforts, the corresponding work, and commitment in order to reach a successful and legitimate end result.

## 9. Conclusion

I perceive the presented dissertation work of the doctoral student Ivan Kantardzhiev as a thorough and complete scientific work on a specific scientific problem, meeting the requirements of the Act on the Development of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria and the Regulations for its implementation.

I express my positive assessment and express my consent to Ivan Ivanov Kantardzhiev to be awarded the scientific and educational degree “Doctor” in the doctoral program “Administrative Security”, in the professional field: 9.1 National Security, field of higher education: 9. Security and Defense.

08.04. 2022

Reviewer:

Prof. ....

I. Velikov, Ph.D.